

# 2019-05-30 AAI Developers Meeting




Attachments (including meeting recording)

File	Modified
Multimedia File Dev Weekly - 2019-05-30.mp4	May 30, 2019 by James Forsyth

Status	OPEN	IN PROGRESS	ON HOLD	DONE	CANCELLED
--------	------	-------------	---------	------	-----------

## Agenda Items

START RECORDING


	Title	Raised By	Status	Last discussed	Notes
1	Review El Alto proposals	James Forsyth	IN PROGRESS		AAI Epics/Stories in JIRA: <a href="#">27 issues</a>
2	2 Types of logging in A&AI WS	Pavel Paroulek	ON HOLD	1st Nov 2018	<p>There are 2 types of logging in the services</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• one read from EELFManager</li><li>• the other Logger log = Logger.getLogger( ...</li></ul> <p>Is that correct? Shouldn't there be just 1 type?</p> <p>1st Nov:</p> <p>After Casablanca release investigate logging guidelines and figure out what library to use in order to unify logging within A&amp;AI</p> <p>26th Nov: See also <a href="#">ONAP Application Logging Specification - Post Dublin</a></p> <p>29th Nov: how does this fit with</p> <div> <b>LOG-877</b> - S3P: Logging streaming/format alignment for dublin - China Telecom, Deutsche Telekom, Vodafone <span>CLOSED</span></div> <p>?</p> <p>28th May: <a href="#">Stela Stoykova</a> is fixing</p> <div> <b>AAI-2462</b> - champ-core, champ-janus, champ-titan use incorrect logger <span>CLOSED</span></div> <p>. Are there more that should be done for El Alto?</p>
3	AAI Standalone UI Access /setup	Thamlur Raju	IN PROGRESS	2019-05-23	<p><a href="#">Francis Paquette</a></p> <p><a href="#">James Forsyth</a></p> <div> <b>AAI-2448</b> - Update the read docs for Sparky- Inventory UI <span>CLOSED</span></div> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• In casablanca environment without Sparky-fe, how we are able to access the AAI-UI?</li><li>• In standalone AAI setup, how can i access the AAI UI? i am running the resources, traversal, elastic-search, search-data-service and sparky-be. but not able to access the UI, need to run any other services to access the UI?</li></ul> <p>tried with below URL,</p> <p><a href="http://&lt;IP&gt;:9517/services/aa/webapp/index.html">http://&lt;IP&gt;:9517/services/aa/webapp/index.html</a></p> <p><b>response:</b></p> <h2>Whitelabel Error Page</h2> <p>This application has no explicit mapping for /error, so you are seeing this as a fallback. Tue May 21 05:07:26 UTC 2019 There was an unexpected error (type=Not Found, status=404). No message available</p>
4	Problems with docker-compose setup	Krzysztof Kurczewski	DONE	2019-05-30	<p>Question raised in comments on <a href="#">AAI Named Queries</a></p> <p>30th May: Probably related to in-memory database setup, which isolates the microservices from each other.</p>

5	AAI schema UML diagram	Keong Lim	IN PROGRESS	2019-05-23	<a href="https://lists.onap.org/g/onap-discuss/topic/31619985">https://lists.onap.org/g/onap-discuss/topic/31619985</a> See also: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>AAI OXM Schema UML</li> <li>AAI EdgeRules UML</li> <li>AAI Swagger v16 UML</li> </ul> Gerrit review for swagger template <a href="https://gerrit.onap.org/r/#/c/87941/">https://gerrit.onap.org/r/#/c/87941/</a> Meeting recording attached to previous week <a href="#">2019-05-16 AAI Developers Meeting</a> See also wiki and sub-pages: <a href="#">Reverse-engineering AAI data model to Papyrus information model</a>
6	Optimise ad-hoc retrieval of any resource with any of its cousin relationships	Keong Lim	IN PROGRESS	2019-05-23	Raised as JIRA case <div> <b>AAI-2437</b> - Optimise ad-hoc retrieval of any resource with any of its cousin relationships           <span>CLOSED</span> </div> Gerrit review <a href="https://gerrit.onap.org/r/#/c/87940/">https://gerrit.onap.org/r/#/c/87940/</a> Would like to gather opinions on the implementation (see the comments in the JIRA case). The query has been tested in my dev environment but unsure if the query is done the best way. <div> <input type="checkbox"/> SoumyaNaikis invited to a future session to discuss further           </div>
7	Dublin Branching	James Forsyth	IN PROGRESS	2019-05-09	El Alto runs Jun - Sep - technical debt and S3P/deployability release Frankfurt starts in Sep As of now, master will accept feature development for Frankfurt We tag dublin at release time (early June) The Dublin branch becomes El Alto (similar to a Dublin Maintenance Release) El Alto changes will be cherry picked back to master
8	GraphGraph demo	Pavel Paroulek	IN PROGRESS	2nd May 2019	A 5-10 minute demo of GraphGraph <div> <b>AAI-534</b> - Tooling and utilities in support of providing visualization for the AAI model, edge rules, and schema           <span>CLOSED</span> </div> <b>Feedback needed!</b>
9	AAI Modeling Multi-part key for schema elements	Keong Lim	IN PROGRESS	25th Apr 2019	From <a href="https://lists.onap.org/g/onap-discuss/topic/31317665">https://lists.onap.org/g/onap-discuss/topic/31317665</a> Discussion: <div> <input type="checkbox"/> The cloud-region schema element is unusual in that it has a two-part key i.e. "cloud-owner" and "cloud-region-id". There are not many other usages of it ("ctag-pool", "service-capability" and "route-target" are three others, out of over 100 other schema elements)           </div> <div> <input type="checkbox"/> Is it possible to enhance the error message to indicate that part of the key value is missing from the relationship-data?           <div> <b>AAI-2394</b> - Improper behavior when relationship-data is missing key attribute(s)           <span>CLOSED</span> </div> </div> <div> <input type="checkbox"/> Is it time to deprecate the relationship-data and switch over to using the related-link only?           </div> <div> <input type="checkbox"/> Is there any modeling guidance that would steer new designs away from using multi-part key for schema elements?           </div> <div> <input type="checkbox"/> Are there other caveats to using the multi-part key design for schema elements?           </div> <div> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Can we get feedback from Chandra Cinthalaon the key design for multi-part keys and whether this will be more common going forward?           <div> <p> <b>From:</b> CINTHALA, CHANDRA [<a href="mailto:cc1196@att.com">mailto:cc1196@att.com</a>]  <b>Sent:</b> Tuesday, April 30, 2019 12:16 AM  <b>To:</b> Keong Lim &lt;<a href="mailto:Keong.Lim@huawei.com">Keong.Lim@huawei.com</a>&gt;; FORSYTH, JAMES &lt;<a href="mailto:jf2512@att.com">jf2512@att.com</a>&gt;  <b>Cc:</b> AGGARWAL, MANISHA &lt;<a href="mailto:amanisha@att.com">amanisha@att.com</a>&gt;  <b>Subject:</b> Re: [confluence] Keong Lim has assigned tasks to you in "2019-05-02 AAI Developers Meeting"               </p> <p>Keong,</p> <p>I think we have no plans to deprecate the relation-data option the in the A&amp;AI relationship payload.</p> <p>It's another option for the client to specify the relationship.</p> <p>Thanks</p> <p>Chandra</p> </div> </div> <div> <input type="checkbox"/> See also email from Marco Platania in <a href="https://lists.onap.org/g/onap-discuss/topic/31385256">https://lists.onap.org/g/onap-discuss/topic/31385256</a> </div>

10	Return codes and messages for WS	<a href="#">Pavel Paroulek</a>	IN PROGRESS	25th Apr 2019	<p>Is there a guide for the description of the error message and the error codes? How are new error states (message + code) added?</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> William LaMont will send James Forsyth the output of a script that formats the error.properties file to make a wiki page and readthedocs</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> <a href="#">James Forsyth</a> should commit that script and create a wiki for the error properties</p>
11	AAI test data bootstrap	<a href="#">Keong Lim</a>	IN PROGRESS	25th Apr 2019	<p>3rd May: See also AAI Simulator in Policy: <a href="https://gerrit.onap.org/r/gitweb?p=policy/models.git;a=blob;f=models-interactions/model-simulators/src/main/java/org/onap/policy/simulators/AaiSimulator.JaxRs.java;hb=HEAD">https://gerrit.onap.org/r/gitweb?p=policy/models.git;a=blob;f=models-interactions/model-simulators/src/main/java/org/onap/policy/simulators/AaiSimulator.JaxRs.java;hb=HEAD</a> . Was recently updated for custom query <a href="https://gerrit.onap.org/r/#/q/pramod+custom">https://gerrit.onap.org/r/#/q/pramod+custom</a> and contains hard-coded AAI data /schema. Maybe discuss with <a href="#">Pamela Dragosh</a> about how this data is maintained?</p> <p>25th Apr: Wiki page <a href="#">OOF - HPA guide for integration testing</a> updated for <a href="https://gerrit.onap.org/r/#/c/86588/">https://gerrit.onap.org/r/#/c/86588/</a></p> <p>Similarly, <a href="#">Scott Seabolt</a> and <a href="#">J Armstrong</a> / <a href="#">Joss Armstrong</a> wrote for APPC <a href="#">Sample A&amp;AI Data Setup for vLB/vDNS for APPC Consumption and Script to load vLB into AAI</a>:</p> <div> <p>The below put_vLB.sh script can be used to submit the vLB data to A&amp;AI in order to run ConfigScaleOut use case. This script and referenced JSON files are used on an AAI instance where the cloud-region and tenant are already defined.</p> </div> <p>Similarly:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><input type="checkbox"/> <a href="#">TEST-133</a> - Demo.sh init step is not adding availability-zone information in AAI <span>CLOSED</span></li> <li><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <a href="#">INT-705</a> - Add availability zone call to AAI in Robot framework <span>CLOSED</span></li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> <a href="#">vCPE Use Case Tutorial: Design and Deploy based on ONAP</a></li> </ul> <p>Related <input type="checkbox"/> <a href="#">AAI-1948</a> - Correct broken links <span>CLOSED</span> on the brittleness of the ReadTheDocs links to data files.</p> <p>One for VIM: How-To: <a href="#">Register a VIM/Cloud Instance to ONAP</a> and <input type="checkbox"/> <a href="#">AAI-1928</a> - AAI-Internal server Error:500 <span>CLOSED</span></p> <p>Potential issues:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• fragility of static import data file w.r.t. schema changes and version upgrades for each ONAP release?</li> <li>• how "common" is this knowledge, i.e. what to load, where to get it, who else should be using it, etc?</li> <li>• should it be automated/scripted, rather than manual steps to bootstrap?</li> <li>• should it be a simulator program or test harness, rather than a static data file?</li> <li>• should it reside within AAI CI/CD jobs for maintenance and upgrade of schema versions?</li> <li>• who maintains the data itself? Is there a "data repository" which can be delegated to other teams, e.g. like documentation repository links in git?</li> <li>• how many other teams have similar private stashes of AAI bootstrap data?</li> <li>• does it need to be published at a stable URL to avoid linkrot?</li> </ul> <p>Possible solution/action:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Look at the examples API and possibly enhance it to get the desired behavior</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Collect all the known data samples, commit to test-config repo, update the teams/wiki to point to test-config repo instead of keeping private stash of AAI data</li> </ul> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <a href="#">AAI-2399</a> - Collate test data from wiki into AAI repository <span>CLOSED</span></p>
12	Purpose of fields in AAI	<a href="#">Keong Lim</a>	IN PROGRESS	18th April 2019	<p><a href="#">Dénés Németh</a> wrote in <input type="checkbox"/> <a href="#">AAI-1104</a> - Invalid handling of external system certificates <span>CLOSED</span> :</p> <div> <p>In think it would be good to answer what is the meaning of the field (collection of PEMs of the CA xor URL)</p> </div> <p>Questions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Is AAI intended to strictly prescribe how the fields are used and what contents are in the values?</li> <li>2. Or does AAI simply reflect the wishes of all the client projects that use it to store and retrieve data?</li> </ol> <p>Even if (1) is true, AAI is not really in any position to enforce how clients use the data, so really (2) is always true and we need to consult the original producers of the data and the ultimate consumers of the data to document their intended meanings.</p> <p>How do we push to have documentation on the purpose and meaning of the fields in AAI?</p> <p>Where does all this documentation go?</p> <p>Should the documentation be backed up by validation code?</p> <p>See also discussion about AAI in <a href="#">2018-11-28 ExtAPI Meeting notes</a></p> <p>29th Nov: Started on new wiki page <a href="#">AAI Schema Producer-Consumer Pairings</a></p> <p>18th Apr: Can we have this documentation go into ONAP in a generic way?</p> <p>24th Apr: See also questions about "sw-version" in <a href="https://wiki.onap.org/display/DW/5G++PNF+Plug+and+Play?focusedCommentId=63996633#comment-63996633">https://wiki.onap.org/display/DW/5G++PNF+Plug+and+Play?focusedCommentId=63996633#comment-63996633</a></p>

13	range query	Keong Lim	IN PROGRESS	7th Feb 2019	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• if I had some AAI data with attributes that are strings but nominally contain date/timestamps, is there a way to query for a particular range of values?</li> <li>• is there a way to do partial match? regex? PUT /aai/v13/query?format=raw</li> </ul> <pre>{ "gremlin": "g.V().has('aai-ts', org.janusgraph.core.attribute.Text.textContains('URL'))" }</pre> <p><a href="https://github.com/JanusGraph/janusgraph/blob/master/janusgraph-core/src/main/java/org/janusgraph/core/attribute/Text.java">https://github.com/JanusGraph/janusgraph/blob/master/janusgraph-core/src/main/java/org/janusgraph/core/attribute/Text.java</a></p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Invite <a href="#">Arul Nambi</a> and <a href="#">CT Paterson</a> to next week's dev call to talk about how sparky/elastic does partial/range matches</p>
14	Schema-service roadmap	James Forsyth Pavel Paroulek	ON HOLD	21st Mar 2019	<p><b>31st Jan 2019:</b></p> <p>The <a href="#">schema-service</a> is ready. Currently it provides file-sharing capabilities in terms of schema/edgerule files.</p> <p>In order for GraphGraph to take advantage of the schema parsing/processing in schema-service additional abstractions have to be implemented on top of the crude file2string functionality currently in schema-service.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Venkata Harish Kajurwill ask Manisha Aggarwal if the current functionality of the schema-service is the final version for Dublin and if there will be further enhancements in next releases.</p> <p><u>GraphGraph needs the following functionality:</u></p> <p><a href="#">Venkata Harish Kajur</a> and <a href="#">Manisha Aggarwal</a> What is missing in schema service that is needed in graphgraph is the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• rest call to get available schemas</li> <li>• list of all schema nodes/items (like vsrver, tenant, p-interfaces..) for example on a REST path /schemas/{schema}/nodes</li> <li>• all relevant attributes of a given node/item for example on REST path /schemas/{schema}/nodes/{node}</li> <li>• edges/relationships with their attributes between schema nodes/items (for example on REST path /schemas/{schema}/edges where you specify a "from" "to" schema items as query params)</li> <li>• subgraph of the schema, where you specify 1. initial (root) items/node (like tenant or vsrver) 2. schema version and 3. number of parent/cousin/child hops from the initial item/node</li> <li>• all paths in a given schema graph between 2 items/nodes (like vsrver and tenant) for a given schema version</li> <li>• edges in the schema graph should be composed of edges in the schema file + edges created from the edgerules file</li> <li>• edges should contain basic attributes when delivered via the subgraph call (like parent/child relationship and important properties from edgerules) and have additional (or all) attributes when queries via /schemas/{schema}/edges REST endpoint.</li> </ul> <p><b>20. Mar 2019:</b></p> <p>Open questions for schema-service:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. what is the current implemented functionality?</li> <li>2. what are the business use-cases in ONAP for schema-service? Description of functionality in relation to other services/projects is needed. In other words who needs it and why?</li> <li>3. if <b>no business</b> use-cases can be formulated we should consider removing schema-service from A&amp;AI and replacing it with standard file-sharing mechanisms.</li> </ol> <p>21st Mar 2019:</p> <p>Based on <a href="#">William Reehil</a> comments</p> <p><a href="https://wiki.onap.org/display/DW/AAI+Schema+Service?focusedCommentId=45299262#comment-45299262">https://wiki.onap.org/display/DW/AAI+Schema+Service?focusedCommentId=45299262#comment-45299262</a> what is "our future proposed functionality"?</p>
15	New AAF Certificates at startup	Jimmy Forsyth	ON HOLD	24th Jan 2019	<p>AAF will generate certificates to be used by the containers at startup; AAI services should use the run-time generated certs instead of the ones that are in the repos or oom charts.</p> <p>In dublin the services will mount a volume with certificates. This is on the roadmap for Dublin as a feature.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• is this for all service and/or HAProxy?</li> <li>• Where are the certificates coming from (OOM/gerrit/generated by AAF)</li> </ul> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> James Forsythwill ask Jonathan Gatham when the certificate init image is going to be available in ONAP and wether it is documented 31 Jan 2019</p>

16	Change PNF to use pnf-id as unique key	<a href="#">Benjamin Cheung</a>  <a href="#">Chesla Wechsler</a>  <a href="#">David Perez Caparros</a>  <a href="#">user-063b3</a>  <a href="#">Matthieu Geerebaert</a>	ON HOLD	7th March 2019	<p>Potentially breaking change: <a href="#">AAI-2096</a> - PNF Plug and Play <span>CLOSED</span> / blocked by</p> <p><a href="#">ONAPARC-409</a> - Dublin Architecture Review: AAI <span>CLOSED</span></p> <p>See also:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Proposal to Change AAI PNF Entity to use PNF-ID as key</li> <li>AAI R4 Use Case and Functional Requirements Impacts</li> <li>Suggestion in comment Re: AAI REST API Documentation - Dublin</li> </ul> <p>Questions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>how to minimise impact of the transition from pnf-name as unique to pnf-id as unique key? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>would the v14 URL be different from the v15 URL? would both paths be equally supported for GET/PUT/etc?</li> </ul> </li> <li>what forwards-compatibility or backwards-compatibility will be supported?</li> <li>how to migrate forwards or backwards database versions, ONAP versions, etc, across this transition?</li> <li>who is going to implement it? Test it?</li> <li>what is the impact of this not going ahead?</li> </ul> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> William LaMont will check for existing migration utility that handles this use case (changing the key from one existing attribute to another). Changes to pnf object in all oxm versions would be needed, and a migration similar to what was done in UriMigration but limited to pnf node-type to update the aai-uri, and a schema mode to add an index on pnf-id.</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> James Forsyth will socialize the breaking change on the PNF in the next PTL call so clients can prepare to do a search for ?pnf-name=\${pnf-name} instead of /pnfs/pnf/\${pnf-name}. They also need to handle doing the PUT operation differently - Added to PTL agenda PTL 2019-02-19</p>
17	A&AI monitoring and failure prevention initiative	<a href="#">Keong Lim</a>	ON HOLD	24th Jan 2019	<p>Mike Elliott wrote in <a href="#">OOM Meeting Notes - 2018-12-5</a></p> <p><i>f. AAI team wanted to get notified of AAI Cassandra issues automatically i. Can we setup a Nagios or equivalent to monitor both rancher/k8 and the applications for rancher/k8 issues ?</i></p> <p>Keep an eye out for new issues!</p> <p>This should be part of a larger A&amp;AI monitoring and failure prevention initiative!</p>
18	AAI HAProxy and 2-way-TLS	<a href="#">Pavel Paroulek</a>	ON HOLD	29th Nov	<p>Technical solution to either decommission the proxy or make design changes to AAF to enable client side certificates.</p> <p>After VF2F we will know if this is a requirement in Dublin. We discuss after this date.</p> <p>question raised: MSB - would client authentication be supported?</p> <p>15th Dec: <a href="https://wiki.onap.org/display/DW/Pluggable+Security#PluggableSecurity-7.10">https://wiki.onap.org/display/DW/Pluggable+Security#PluggableSecurity-7.10</a> <a href="#">Identifiedandsupportedpatternsandfeatures</a></p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> James Forsyth creates a task for encryption of communication between A&amp;AI services and Cassandra <b>24 Jan 2019</b></p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Tian Lee and Steven Blimkie to report on the Amdocs managed A&amp;AI microservice wheter they support criteria from the <a href="#">Dublin S3P requirements</a> <b>31 Jan 2019</b></p>
19	AAI too slow for OOF/HAS	<a href="#">Keong Lim</a>	ON HOLD	25th Apr 2019	<p>Under OOF <a href="#">Homing and Allocation Service (HAS)</a> section, <a href="#">Dileep Ranganathan</a> wrote about <a href="#">Project Specific enhancements</a>:</p> <p><i>Optimize - AAI cache</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Use MUSIC or any other alternative in memory caching like Redis etc?</li> <li>Optimize flavor retrieval from A&amp;AI and Cache the information if necessary</li> </ul> <p>See also <a href="#">OPTFRA-268</a> - OOF - project specific enhancements <span>CLOSED</span> /</p> <p><a href="#">OPTFRA-294</a> - Optimize the use of AAI cache in HAS Data component <span>CLOSED</span></p> <p>Similarly to the "AAI too slow for Holmes" item below, this introduction of extra caching of AAI data is a worrisome development and sad indictment of the performance of the system architecture.</p> <p>For holmes, we could possibly create a custom query to address it.</p> <p>What can we do about this?</p> <p>Would the AAI Cacher <a href="#">AAI-1337</a> - AAI Cacher <span>CLOSED</span> help to improve performance?</p>

20	MultiCloud usage of AAI for HPA telemetry/time-series data to OOF	Keong Lim	ON HOLD	18th April 2019	<p>Bin Yang and Lianhao Lu wrote in</p> <div>  <a href="#">MULTICLOUD-274</a> - HPA telemetry data collection and persistence         <span>CLOSED</span> </div> <p>:</p> <p><i>HPA telemetry data collection and make it persistent in A&amp;AI, from which OOF can leverage during its decision making process.</i></p> <p>and</p> <p><i>1. Multi-cloud to collect the data from time-series data services like Prometheus (<a href="http://prometheus.io">http://prometheus.io</a>) or openstack Gnocchi, and push them to A&amp;AI based on the data recording &amp; aggregation rules.</i></p> <p>and</p> <p><i>The reason why we propose here is that VES mechanism doesn't store the telemetry data into A&amp;AI. And OOF now can only get those kind of data from A&amp;AI.</i></p> <p>Some concerns:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ how much additional load will this place on AAI?</li> <li>■ will AAI cope with this load?</li> <li>■ is AAI suitable for "time-series data"?</li> <li>■ is "telemetry data" considered to be "active &amp; available inventory"?</li> <li>■ should OOF access the telemetry/time-series data via other means (not AAI)?</li> <li>■ AAI API latency (4~6 second per request as benchmarked in CMCC lab) could be a problem</li> </ul>
21	AAI Backup and Restore	Keong Lim	ON HOLD	10th Jan 2019	<p><i>what would be the approach to backup an entire ONAP instance particularly SDC, AAI, SDNC data ? would it be a script with all the references to the helm deploy releases or something that does a helm list and then for each entry does the ark backup ?</i></p> <p>What is the AAI strategy for backup and restore?</p> <p>What is the overall ONAP strategy for backup and restore?</p> <p>Should it be unified with the data migration strategy as per "Hbase to Cassandra migration" on <a href="#">2018-11-14 AAI Meeting Notes</a>?</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> James Forsyth will raise the topic of having backups and restore functionality in ONAP - if it is feasible, on the roadmap and what others PTL think</p> <p>Jimmy didn't directly raise the topic but there was movement - <a href="#">Keong Lim</a> asked "if istio service mesh is a no-go, is there a replacement for secure onap communications? is backup/restore/upgradability included in s3p?"</p> <p><a href="#">Michael O'Brien</a> replied that a reference tool set for backup and restore was introduced in Casablanca: <a href="#">Backup and Restore Solution: ONAP-OOM</a></p> <p><a href="#">Mike Elliott</a> said he would look at Brian's question, AAI will provide support as needed.</p>